

1st REPORT

ON

SYSTEMATIC REVIEW THROUGH DISTRICT LEVEL MONITORING AND REVIEW MEETINGS

BY

CABINET MINISTERS

AS AT July, 2018

Programme Implementation and Evaluation Department

Govt. of Meghalaya

INDEX

	CONTENTS	PAGE NO.
1	INTRODUCTION	1 – 2
2	KEY FINDINGS OF THE REVIEW	3 – 18
3	SUGGESTIONS MADE BY THE DISTRICT OFFICIALS	19 – 24
4	CONCLUSION	25

INTRODUCTION

"We are responsible for what we are, and whatever we wish ourselves to be, we have the power to make ourselves. If what we are now has been the result of our own past actions, it certainly follows that whatever we wish to be in future can be produced by our present actions; so we have to know how to act."

With these sentiments, to reach out to the last mile population, the Govt. envisaged <u>"Systematic Review"</u> vide Notification No. PIA.26/2018/12 dated 14th May 2018, through which all Cabinet Ministers were allotted, one district each to carry out the review of the flagship programmes in the state. (Copy of the Notification is placed as Annexure I to the Report).

The need for such a review system arises, to understand the key challenges and barriers in delivery of the development initiatives, to use convergence framework for mobilizing resources and to measure the progress through process monitoring and key performance indicators, for clean, effective and efficient Public Service delivery to all the citizens of our state.

The purpose of the Systematic Review is:

- To facilitate effective implementation of development programmes and schemes of the Government for efficient delivery of public services in a transparent and timebound manner
- To bring Inter-departmental Coordination and Collaboration for smooth implementation of various developmental programmes
- To mobilize resources (human and financial) through convergence for formulating Innovative and Community-driven Projects as development solutions for the last mile population
- To provide a platform for experience-sharing and replication of best practices, throughout the state
- To enable concurrent review of the schemes for initiating timely corrective measures.

For Systematic Review, the Programme Implementation & Evaluation Department is notified as the Nodal Department and the office of the Deputy Commissioner as the Coordinating Agency at the District Level. The checklist for Systematic Review was prepared and circulated to all the Cabinet Ministers, the Deputy Commissioners and concerned Departments for district level Review meetings, to be chaired by the Cabinet Ministers. The schemes covered under Systematic Review are mainly flagship programmes implemented in the State, as given below:

- Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (MGNREGS)
- Indira Awaas Yojana (IAY)/Prime Minister Awaas Yojana (PMAY)
- National Social Assistance Programme (NSAP)
- Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA)
- Mid-Day Meal (MDM)
- Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS)
- National Health Mission (NHM)
- National Rural Drinking Water Programme (NRDWP)
- Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC)/ Swachh Bharat Mission (SBM)
- Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana (PMGSY)
- Accelerated Irrigation Benefit Programme (AIBP)/ Pradhan Mantri Krishi Sinchai Yojana (PMKSY)
- Rashtriya Krishi Vikas Yojana (RKVY)

Name of the Cabinet Minister	Name of the District	Date of Review Meeting
Sh. James P. K. Sangma	West Khasi Hills District, Nongstoin	19.6.2018 - 20.6.2018
Sh. Kyrmen Shylla	South West Garo Hills District, Ampati	26.6.2018 - 27.6.2018
Sh. A. L. Hek	North Garo Hills District, Resubelpara	27.6.2018
Sh. Lahkmen Rymbui	West Garo Hills District, Tura	27.6.2018 - 28.6.2018
Sh. Metbah Lyngdoh	South Garo Hills District, Baghmara	27.6.2018 - 28.6.2018
Sh. Prestone Tynsong, Deputy Chief Minister	East Khasi Hills District, Shillong	29.6.2018
Sh. Banteidor Lyngdoh	East Garo Hills District, Williamnagar	29.6.2018
Sh. Hamlet Dohling	West Jaintia Hills District, Jowai	5.7.2018- 6.7.2018
Sh. Sniawbhalang Dhar	Ri Bhoi District, Nongpoh	18.7.2018

As at July 2018, the following review meetings have been conducted:

KEY FINDINGS OF THE REVIEW

Upon review of the flagship programmes during such meetings, certain issues/findings were raised by the district officials, which are collated by the Programme Implementation and Evaluation Department and are presented below (Scheme-wise):

Sl. No.	Name of the District	Problems/Findings
1.	West Khasi Hills	 Late receipt of funds for material and wage components from the Ministry Problem of Management Information System (MIS)
2.	South West Garo Hills	 Late receipt of funds Non-availability of boulders and stone chips
3.	West Garo Hills	 Lack of banks in the interior areas Banks insisting on Permanent Account Number (PAN), Aadhaar in addition to Electors Photo Identity Card (EPIC) for opening bank accounts
4.	South Garo Hills	 Poor internet connectivity in the interior areas Most of the Job Card Holders do not have personal Bank Account due to non availability of Bank branches Poor internet connectivity
5.	East Khasi Hills	• Direct Benefit Transfer problem in the Blocks where non-operational Bank Accounts exist, since all Village Employment Councils (VECs) and job card holders should have bank accounts
6.	West Jaintia Hills	No problems
7.	Ri Bhoi	• Irregular flow of fund since most of the schemes are physically completed but no funds are forthcoming
8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	1 st Review not yet done

MAHATMA GANDHI NATIONAL RURAL EMPLOYMENT GUARANTEE SCHEME (MGNREGS)

INDIRA AWAAS YOJANA (IAY)/PRADHAN MANTRI AWAAS YOJANA - (PMAY - G)

Sl. No.	Name of the District	Problems/Findings
1.	West Khasi Hills	 Delay in releasing of funds from the Government of India (GOI). Till date, the 2nd and the 3rd installment has not yet been released Most of the economically poor beneficiaries use the money for construction only partially and mis-utilise the rest of the amount for other purposes
2.	South West Garo Hills	 Beneficiaries are having difficulty to withdraw funds sanctioned to their Pradhan Mantri Jan Dhan Yojana (PMJDY) accounts since it has a withdrawal limit of Rs. 10,000/- p.m. only. Moreover, big amounts cannot be deposited in the bank Most of the banks deduct the outstanding amount from the beneficiaries for their old loans when amount is credited for PMAY – G Non convergence between MGNREGS and PMAY-G due to late receipt of funds under either scheme
3.	West Garo Hills	 Delay in construction of houses due to unavailability of funds in the State Misuse of IAY 2015-16 funds by beneficiaries Poor internet connectivity in the interior areas Beneficiary having PMJDY accounts faces problems since the bank does not allow credit of more than Rs.50,000/- at one point. Delay in completion of IAY 2015-16 houses due to negligence by the beneficiaries.
4.	South Garo Hills	 Payment of 2nd instalment of 2016-17 stopped due to non receipt of funds from GOI leading to delayed construction of houses. Funds yet to be sanctioned by GOI for 2017-18 Poor internet connectivity in the interior areas High cost of building materials and high transportation charges make it very difficult to construct the houses within the sanctioned amount.
5.	East Khasi Hills	 Schemes are physically completed but funds not released. There is a problem of allotment of funds in every Block Random selection of beneficiaries by National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM). The beneficiary is selected from households with parameters as per Socio Economic Caste Census (SECC) 2011 data which is verified by the Gram Sabha (Village Dorbar). In Mawphlang and Mylliem Blocks there are very few beneficiaries of PMAY-G.
6.	West Jaintia Hills	Network problem is common in many rural villages
7.	Ri Bhoi	 Non receipt of funds for 2017-18 The number of household beneficiaries is very less in the District since many households were left out due to non completion of the SECC 2011.

8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	• 1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	• 1 st Review not yet done

NATIONAL SOCIAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAMME (NSAP)

Amount of financial assistance under each component

- Indira Gandhi National Old Age Pension Scheme (IGNOAPS) (60-79 yrs Rs 500/p.m, 80yrs above-Rs 550/-p.m.) (BPL family)
- Indira Gandhi National Widow Pension Scheme (IGNWPS) Rs 500/- p.m. (18yrs above, BPL family)
- Indira Gandhi National Disability Pension Scheme (IGNDPS) Rs 500/- p.m. (60 yrs & above, BPL family)

✤ National Family Benefit Scheme (NFBS) – Rs 20000/- (Paid to Dependent Parents) Payment through Post Office/Bank account.

Sl.	Name of the District	Problems/Findings
No.		
1.	West Khasi Hills	 Low achievement of NFBS is due to less applications. The Socio Economic Caste Census (SECC) has not notified the BPL list till date Disbursement of NOAPS to the beneficiaries depends on the funds received from the State Government which is once in every 3-4 months Problem of Management Information System (MIS)
2.	South West Garo Hills	• NOAPS amount is expected every month by the beneficiaries but due to delay in receipt of funds it could not be achieved
3.	West Garo Hills	 Work delay due to poor server of NSAP No bank offices in interior areas There has been no allotment for Annapurna Scheme since 2015. Funds were drawn for 2015-16 but foodgrains could not be uplifted from Food Corporation of India (FCI)
4.	South Garo Hills	 Most of the beneficiaries do not have money at hand to keep minimum balance and hence cannot maintain active bank account. No bank branches in interior areas Irregular internet connectivity
5.	East Khasi Hills	• Shifting from Post Office account to Bank account is a time consuming exercise as beneficiaries do not provide the details required for opening Bank accounts
6.	Ri Bhoi	No discussion.

7.	West Jaintia Hills	 Since October 2015 no more funds against Annapurna Scheme has been received from the Govt. Problem of eligibility criteria set by the Central Govt. has to be taken up by the State Govt. {Eligibility criteria is (a) person who is 65 years or above (b) destitute having no regular means of sustenance & (c) should not be a beneficiary under NOAPS}.
8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	1 st Review not yet done

SARVA SHIKSHA ABHIYAN (SSA)

Sl.	Name of the	Problems/Findings
No.	District	
1.	West Khasi Hills	 Delay and untimely release of fund from State Govt. Lack of training for each Intervention* sanctioned (School Managing Committee Members, Teachers, professionals for out of school children etc.) The funds for Teachers Training has not yet been released by the State Project Director Poverty, unwillingness, family problems, children under 14 years are engaged in activities like cattle rearing, farming and early marriage Non compliance and lack of experience of School Managing Committee (SMC).
2.	South West Garo Hills	 Irregular Flow of Funds Less enrolment of school going children No water facility in Zikzak Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalaya (KGBV) and no boundary wall for protection in both Betasing and Zikzak KGBV. Problem of internet connectivity.
3.	West Jaintia Hills	 Non approval of Civil works (New LPS/UPS, Additional Class Room (ACR), repairing of Block Resource Centres (BRCs)/Community Resource Centres (CRCs), repairing of Govt schools due to non availability of funds from State Govt.) Delay in releasing of Fund by the State to the District [especially the salary of Academic Support Staff, Teachers, Block Resource Persons (BRPs), Community Resource Persons (CRPs), etc.] Non availability of fund for Innovative Interventions Receipt of approved Project Approval Board (PAB) for Computer Education by the District is delayed.

4.	West Garo Hills	 Delay in release of funds for infrastructure, training, salary etc. Single teacher in large number of Government Schools No proper infrastructure for conducting trainings for Community at the grass root level Non availability of Professionals in taking care of out of school children including their enrolment and retention at the grass root level Early marriage, especially girl child Professional Training of teachers through National Institute of Open Schooling (NIOS) - Necessary and proper communication and circulars are not issued by Directorate of Educational Research and Training (DERT) creating problems for teachers to pursue their training. The same has to be completed by March 2019. Non availability of Special Training materials in other languages than Garo and English.
5.	South Garo Hills	• No discussion.
6.	East Khasi Hills	• Free text books reach the schools very late since publishers take time to despatch the same
7.	Ri Bhoi	No discussion.
8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	1 st Review not yet done

* **Interventions** – Innovative activity for girls' education, early childhood care & education (ECCE), interventions for children belonging to SC/ST community, computer education specially for upper primary level, interventions for out of school children, Training of community leaders, Innovative education for the disabled.

MID DAY MEAL (MDM)

Sl.	Name of the	Problems/Findings
No.	District	
1.	West Khasi	• Payment of honorarium for cook cum helper is not sufficient
	Hills	(Rs. 1000/-) p.m.
		The rate of conversion is not sufficient
		Low rate of transportation cost
2.	South West	The honorarium of cook-cum-helper is very less
	Garo Hills	Release of conversion cost is delayed
		Many schools do not have water supply connection.
		• Many schools do not have proper kitchen shed and store
		rooms

3.	West Garo Hills	 The payment of Honorarium for Cook-cum-Helper (Rs.1000/-per month per cook) is not sufficient, which lead to resignation of cooks and the implementation of the scheme is disturbed Serving of MDM is disturbed whenever receipt of sanction for food grains and cooking cost is not uniform Lifting of foodgrains is delayed due to lack of transportation cost. Low rate of transportation cost, only Rs.58.88p per quintal, which is not sufficient for lifting foodgrains for the schools located in rural areas
4.	South Garo Hills	 The honorarium of Cook-cum-Helper needs to be increased Food grain and cooking gas should be released simultaneously There is no fund provided for serving plates. Many schools in the District have old kitchen sheds cum store rooms
5.	East Khasi Hills	 Problem of cook cum helper who receives honorarium of Rs 1000/-only p.m. which is hard for them to manage & they resign from time to time which creates a problem in the School The rate of conversion cost is too low as compared with the actual market price for serving MDM at School and many schools are facing difficulties in managing as per the given rate which is Rs 4.13p for LP school & Rs 6.18p for UP school In Shella and Khatarshnong Blocks, the cost of kitchen shed is Rs. 60,000/= with no storage facilities as rooms are small and most are in damaged condition
6.	West Jaintia Hills	 Due to the low honorarium paid to the cook cum helpers, most of the cooks cum helpers resign especially those who have been trained in various aspects such as in hygienic way of cooking & serving of MDM and appointment of new ones, only delays the scheme as they have to be trained again Low rate of cooking cost for both LPS & UPS
7.	Ri Bhoi	No discussion.
8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	• 1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	• 1 st Review not yet done

INTEGRATED CHILD DEVELOPMENT SERVICES (ICDS)

Sl. No.	Name of the District	Problems/Findings
1.	West Jaintia Hills	 All the offices are run from the rented buildings Presently all the Child Development Project Officers (CDPOs) do not have Govt. allotted vehicles thereby hampering the effective monitoring & implementation of the Schemes

-	TA7 T71 '	
2.	West Khasi Hills	• Less number of centres with own building affect the functioning of ICDS
		No internet connectivity
		No office vehicle
		No sanctioned posts of Driver and Chowkidar
		• Funds for Office Expenses (OE), Travelling Allowance (TA)/ Travel
		Expenses (TE) are not regular
3.	West Garo Hills	• Non-availability of Government Accommodation for Office building at the Block level as well as in Urban
		• Irregular timings of Anganwadi Centres (AWCs). AWCs open sometimes in Morning and sometimes in the afternoon
		Irregular Sanction of fund for payment of honorarium of AWWs
		• Poor internet connectivity, affecting online submission of monthly reports at the Block HQ
4.	South Garo	Funds not received on time
1.	Hills	 Irregular electricity & mobile network
		 Poor road connectivity
		·
		• As per ICDS norms, the house rent at the Block level is Rs.6,600/= which is not sufficient.
		• Monitoring problem due to non-availability of official vehicles and
		funds for hiring of vehicles in Baghmara, Rongara and Chockpot ICDS
		projects.
		• Data Entry Operator post needs to be created. More Supervisors
		needed for proper monitoring of AWCs.
5.	East Khasi Hills	• Most of the Anganwadi centres do not have their own buildings since they are functioning in the Block Offices which affects the implementation of the scheme
		 Delay in receipt of funds for honorarium of AWWs. Non receipt of funds for TA of Staff
		• Most of the beneficiaries in the age group of 3-6 years attend Private Schools which results in low coverage of Pre-school
		• Qualification for Aganwadi workers and helpers is Matriculate, which is hard to find in the villages.
		• The cost norm is too low to meet the calorie norm prescribed by the Food Security Act.
		• Challenges in eliciting Community participation for availing services due to Aadhar enrolment
6.	Ri Bhoi	• Most of the Anganwadi centres do not have their own buildings since
		they are functioning in the Block Offices which affects the implementation of the scheme
		• Delay in receipt of funds for honorarium of AWWs. Non receipt of funds for TA of Staff
		• Most of the beneficiaries in the age group of 3-6 years attend Private
		 Schools which results in low coverage of Pre-school No vehicles, office buildings and godown owned.
		• Lack of manpower.
		• Challenges in eliciting Community participation for availing services
		due to Aadhar enrolment

7.	South West Garo Hills	 Non- availability of Govt. building for office accommodation No internet facility for uploading of MIS and Public Financial Management System (PFMS) Monitoring problem due to non-availability of travelling allowance and hiring of vehicles. Shortage of staff.
8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	1 st Review not yet done

NATIONAL HEALTH MISSION (NHM)

Sl.	Name of the	Problems/Findings
No.	District	
1.	West Garo Hills	 No trained surgeon available in the District for conducting vasectomy. Need more trained medical officers for conducting Tubectomy Most of the health sub-centres are not suitable for conducting normal deliveries by ANM with dilapidated Assam type buildings with space constraint and no basic amenities even at the newly constructed RCC sub-centres Irregular and untimely fund flow Need at least 20 bedded District Maternity & Child Hospital, Tura mainly for Tubectomy clients (for providing pre & post operative wards) Need to equip all the CHCs for conducting tubectomy. No suitable place for conducting trainings at the District headquarter Supply of logistics or any other material from the State to the District should be systematic and also need to ensure no stock out situation at state level
2.	South Garo Hills	 Delay in appointment of Specialist in Baghmara Civil Hospital has deprived the public from availing the Specialist services. No Medical & Health Officer in Moheskola PHC No potable water supply in all the Health centres. Electricity in Baghmara is very irregular and it is very difficult to maintain the cold chain points. X-ray machine not available in Chokpot CHC Due to bad road connectivity, it is very difficult to refer the serious patients to higher facility as it takes 5 to 6 hours to Tura and the maintenance of vehicles goes high. Communication in South Garo Hills in terms of Network Connectivity has always been a problem, which hampers the smooth services of health care delivery. All the facilities are running with only one Ambulance No truck for carriage of medicine which is very much necessary & urgently required Full fledged Health Engineering wing needs to be set up in South Garo Hills.

3.	West Khasi Hills	• No problems flagged
4.	South West Garo Hills	 No designated programme officers/Maternal and Child Health (MCH) Officer to look after the Reproductive and Child Health (RCH) programmes. No Pediatrician & Gynaecologist at District Hospital Insufficient fund allocation to the District
5.	East Khasi Hills	• Shortfall in appointment of Doctors as only 30% Doctors come back after their studies and join service. There are 51 Doctors in the CHCs/PHCs whilst according to norms, there should be 78 Doctors in all (50 Doctors serving in the CHCs and 28 Doctors serving in the PHCs)
6.	West Jaintia Hills	 Building for in-door patients not completed in Jarain PHC Non- receipt of measles vaccines from State Govt.
7.	Ri Bhoi	 Lack of specialists Doctors in Civil Hospital. Shortage of Officers at the District Level i.e. DMHO, Addl DMHO, District Maternal & Child Health Officer (DMCHO), District Malaria Officer (DMO) and Senior Medical & Health Officer. No MBBS Medical Officer at Mawlasnai PHC. One more Medical Officer is needed at Byrnihat PHC, Umden PHC, Patharkhmah CHC and Umsning CHC due to high case load Jirang State Dispensary and Barapani State Dispensary in a very bad condition in terms of infrastructure Interruption in flow of fund from State to district, leading to fund constraint No office building for the office of the District Medical & Health Officer No office establishment of District Malaria Officer Delivering services to Block II (disputed areas), hard to reach areas is difficult due to lack of proper road network Shortage of Ambulances as some ambulances are more than five years and frequently break down Irregular supply of electricity and internet connectivity
8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	 No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	• 1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	• 1 st Review not yet done

NATIONAL RURAL DRINKING WATER PROGRAMME (NRDWP)

Sl.	Name of the District	Problems/Findings
No.		
1.	West Khasi Hills	 Deforestation leading to drying up of water sources Lack of manpower (field staff and in the laboratory) Unavailability of feasible water sources Non sanction of proposed schemes for the last five years. Shortage of operation and maintenance (O &M) fund.
2.	West Garo Hills	Sources are drying up in catchment areas

3.	South West Garo Hills	• No sanction for last 5 (five) years. Proposals for converting Partially Covered (PC) habitations to Fully Covered (FC) habitations are being submitted but sanction has not been accorded till date.
4.	South Garo Hills	 Rapid reduction in the discharge of drinking water sources is a cause of worry Due to paucity of funds and delay in receipt of materials like pipe, schemes are not completed on time Mobile Phone and Internet connectivity in the District is presently poor and uploading the information in MIS is quite difficult.
5.	East Khasi Hills	• Due to shortage of funds allotted to the State, the pending committed liability of ongoing NRDWP scheme could not be cleared up in time and no new work can be taken up in achieving the national goal of providing potable Water Supply to all the villages @ 70 LPCD by 2020
6.	West Jaintia Hills	 Ummulong-Moodymmai Combined Water Supply Scheme Initially progress of works was good but it has slowed down due to non-availability of fund. The up-to-date physical progress of the scheme is 75% & does not qualify for further allotment of fund, since the thrust area for NRDWP fund is for 100% physically completed schemes. However, it is expected that in the financial year 2018-19, the Govt. of India may consider to allot fund for schemes which are not yet 100% physically completed All plots of land required for construction of intake arrangement, Pump house, Water Treatment Plant, Main reservoir, Zonal reservoirs & pipe line routes belong to private land owners & on several occasions, due to change in ownership, they were reluctant to part with the plots of land
7.	Ri Bhoi	• Delay in sanction has affected the completion of works. Moreover, as per Guidelines, no new scheme will be sanctioned unless old scheme is 100% completed
8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	1 st Review not yet done

SWACHH BHARAT MISSION (SBM)

Sl. No.	Name of the District	Problems/Findings
1.	West Khasi Hills	 Availability of water is a major concern for many villages as the Central Ministry (MDWS) is focusing more on SBM than NRDWP and therefore no sanction of water supply scheme for the past 5 years In some villages, there is lack of maintenance of toilets by the beneficiaries.
2.	South West Garo Hills	No problems raised
3.	West Garo Hills	 Damage to toilets constructed in the flood affected areas Scheme could not be completed in time since supply of construction materials is disrupted during rainy season
4.	South Garo Hills	 Lack of co-operation from the beneficiaries and because of hilly terrain areas The final payment has not been cleared to Individual Household Latrines (IHHL) due to non completion of IHHL construction and geo-tagging.
5.	East Khasi Hills	• Non-functional toilet from old sanction (TSC Rs.3000) as there is problem in water supply in villages due to no water connection. TSC toilets (Rs 3000/-) are not up to the mark as most are not functional
6.	West Jaintia Hills	 One of the biggest challenges with respect to the programme is that it is rigidly time bound {to achieve ODF India by October 2019} Secondly, the Baseline 2012 is outdated since there are households that exist after 2012 survey which do not benefit from the first component .i.e. Individual Household Latrine (IHHL). There are also missing villages from the baseline which is yet to be resolved
7.	Ri Bhoi	No discussion.
8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	• 1 st Review not yet done

PRADHAN MANTRI GRAM SADAK YOJANA (PMGSY)

Sl. No.	Name of the District	Problems/Findings
1.	West Khasi Hills	• Due to some technical problems, the construction of roads from (a) Tyllang to Nongriat and (b) from Nongshillong to Mawthadraishan Stage II were delayed. At present, the DPR for the same has been sent to Head Office Shillong for approval.
2.	South West Garo Hills	 The biggest problem which is prevailing till date is the ban of Quarries and Crusher Plants Lack of Technical Personnel to look after the Scheme Lack of competence of small contractors with regards to Contract Management Knowhow.
3.	West Garo Hills	 Most of the Works were allotted during the Monsoon Period where contractors cannot immediately start the work due to rain Ban of Quarries and Crusher Plants has affected supply of construction materials Lack of dedicated man power for supervision and implementation for PMGSY works Up to May/June of 2016, due to law and order problems, progress of all works was very slow.
4.	South Garo Hills	Late receipt of funds
5.	East Khasi Hills	 Limited working season as working season starts from October to April Quarrying materials e.g. sand, stone, etc restricted due to health hazard & ecological imbalance Lack of technical manpower of the executing agency Difficult terrain conditions Land problems as the people demand compensation for their land. Construction materials e.g. explosive, steel, bitumen etc. are not readily available in the State. Skilled labourers are brought from outside the State which is objected to by local NGOs.
6.	West Jaintia Hills	Shortage of Technical staff
7.	Ri Bhoi	 Conflict with Assam Govt. for construction of roads. {Bakhlapara to Junbarigoan i/c bridge18 m span (L – 2.225 Km), Pahamshru to Ranibari i/c bridge 30m span (L – 4.00 Km.) & Junbarigoan to Belakhowa i/c 2 Nos. bridges 20m & 18.1 m span (L – 8.608 Km.)}

8.	East Garo Hills	•	No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	•	No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	•	1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	•	1 st Review not yet done

ACCELERATED IRRIGATION BENEFITS PROGRAMME (AIBP)/ PRADHAN MANTRI KRISHI SINCHAI YOJANA (PMKSY)

[CONCERNED DEPARTMENTS – SOIL & WATER CONSERVATION AND WATER RESOURCES]

Sl.	Name of the	Problems/Findings
No.	District	, C
1.	West Khasi Hills	 Irregular fund flow (Soil & Water Cons.) Shortage of manpower (Soil & Water Cons.) [(i) Strength of Asstt. Soil & Water Conservation Officers (AS&WCOs) is only 2 against actual nos. which is 4, (ii) No staff in Watershed Cell cum Data Centre (WCDC) against actual nos. which is 3, (iii) Field staff are usually occupied with other official duties than departmental works] Shortage of manpower (Water Resources)
2.	South West Garo Hills	 Inadequate funds for regular maintenance/repair of projects (Water Resources) The manpower in the District is under staffed. The Division has only 2JEs, 1 SA beside AE. Supervision of ongoing works has become difficult (Water Resources) There is no sanction for IWMP under Soil & Water Conservation.
3.	West Garo Hills	 Delay in receiving of funds has affected the implementation of schemes (Soil & Water Cons.) The cost of the project has to be compromised as the admissible cost per hectare rate is quite low (Water Resources) Lack of minimal funds for regular operation & maintenance (O & M) has hindered proper functioning of the projects (Water Resources)
4.	South Garo Hills	 Irregular fund flow and delay in releasing the fund has led to the cost escalation of construction materials/wages (Soil & Water Cons.) Insufficient sanctioned posts for technical and field staff in the Division (Water Resources) The admissible cost per hectare is very low in hilly terrain (Soil & Water Cons.) There are no funds for maintenance of the projects (Soil & Water Cons.) NGT ban has also made Project more difficult in procuring construction materials such as chips and boulders, affecting the momentum & timely completion of the projects (Soil & Water Cons.)

5.	East Khasi Hills	 Untimely & irregular flow of funds (Soil & Water Cons.) High transportation cost of produce from the project site to the market (Soil & Water Cons.) Cost norms are too low compared to daily wages (Soil & Water Cons.) Delay in payments due to the introduction of digital mode of payment which is not yet efficient & smooth (Soil & Water Cons.)
6.	West Jaintia Hills	 Untimely & irregular flow of funds has affected timely completion of the Projects, leading to cost escalation (Soil & Water Cons.) Due to prolonged gaps between the instalments, it has hampered the smooth completion of the projects. There is cost escalation, which sometimes lead to reduction of the length of the canals since the schedule of rates incorporated at the time of the project proposals is of the year 2010-11(Soil & Water Cons.) No funds for periodical maintenance of Headwork & Canals for longevity of the structures (Water Resources) Due to limited working season because of rainfall, projects take longer to complete (Water Resources) Due to harsh & difficult terrain of most sites, it becomes difficult to restrict the cost to the norms given by Govt. of India (Water Resources) Most farmers depend entirely on the Department even for minor maintenance & repairs and this becomes a problem, causing defects & damages over a period of time due to irregular & scarce maintenance funds, more so because the Projects are subject to all types of weather conditions (Water Resources)
7.	Ri Bhoi	 Shortage of Technical Staff (Water Resources) Very less funds are allocated for maintenance of canals/ irrigation projects (Water Resources) Funds for Community organizations (Water Users Associations/ User Groups) are not available (Soil & Water Cons.)
8.	East Garo Hills	 No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	 No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	1 st Review not yet done

RASHTRIYA KRISHI VIKAS YOJANA (RKVY)

[CONCERNED DEPARTMENTS – AGRICULTURE, HORTICULTURE, SOIL & WATER CONSERVATION, WATER RESOURCES, ANIMAL HUSBANDRY & VETERINARY, COOPERATION & FISHERIES]

Sl.	Name of the	Problems/Findings
No.	District	
1.	South West Garo Hills	 No funds received for AH & Vety (no sanction for 2016-17) and Agriculture. In respect of Horticulture, funds are not received on time, hampering the implementation of the projects In respect of Horticulture, seeds for plantation of orange budded for 2017-18 is received only in 2018-19.
2.	West Garo Hills	 Funds not received on time in respect of Agriculture Shortage of manpower at the block level (Agri) Delay in sanction of funds in respect of Fisheries In respect of Water Resources Deptt, transportation of construction materials is a major problem in remote areas In respect of Water Resources, under RKVY only construction of Check Dams is allowed and there is no provision for conveyance system like canals etc.
3.	South Garo Hills	 In respect of Agriculture Deptt, there are no funds sanctioned for construction of check dams/ mini dams for the last five years Creation of posts of 1 (one) A.H. & Vety Officer, 2 (two) Veterinary Field Assistants, 1 (one) Peon & 1 (one) Chowkidar, each at Dimapara and Rongru A'sim Vety. Dispensary (A.H. & Vety.) Creation of posts of 1 (one) A.H. & Vety Officer, 2 (two) Veterinary Field Assistants, 1 (one) Laboratory Technician & 1 (one) Chowkidar at District Diagnostic Laboratory, Baghmara (A.H. & Vety.) Replacement of Transformer and installation of 25 kva Generator is urgently required at the farm (A.H. & Vety.) Construction of New staff quarters at the farm and DVO Complex (A.H. & Vety.) Renovation of existing Vety. Aid Centres, mainly Moheskola, Karukol and Silkigre (A.H. & Vety.)
4.	East Khasi Hills	 In respect of Horticulture, the untimely release of funds has hampered the projects The rate of contribution for certain components like Polyhouses is too high to be borne by the farmers (Horti) - 50% contribution by the farmers under Mission for Integrated Development of Horticulture (MIDH) Most of the Horticulture activities are time bound and untimely receipt of funds has posed problems Bamboo & Wooden structures do not last long & have to be replaced every year (Horti).
5.	West Jaintia Hills	 In respect of Fisheries Deptt, it is often observed that due to the high cost of imported fish feed, the entrepreneurs tend to ignore buying & using it. This in turn results in low yield/production of fish or may also lead to "Pinhead disease" which is a food deficiency syndrome No Schemes from 2016-17 & 2017-18 All schemes are from 2014-15.

6.	West Khasi Hills	Shortage of manpower (Agri.)
7.	Ri Bhoi	 In respect of Water Resources Deptt. there is shortage of technical staff No funds allocated for maintenance of projects (Water Resources) Lack of organized market infrastructure (Horti). Due to high perishability of horticultural crops there is need to strengthen post harvest management (Horti). Absence of pre cooling and cold storage (Horti). The marketing system is more middlemen oriented than producer and consumer oriented (Horti). Wide gap in technology available and actual application in the field (Horti).
8.	East Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date
9.	North Garo Hills	• No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date
10.	East Jaintia Hills	• 1 st Review not yet done
11.	South West Khasi Hills	• 1 st Review not yet done

SUGGESTIONS/POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS

During the review meetings, the district officials made certain suggestions/ Possible solutions, which are compiled by the Programme Implementation & Evaluation Department and are given below (district-wise)

WEST KHASI HILLS

- Improvement of MIS (MGNREGA)
- Timely release of fund will improve the overall performance for MGNREGA and AIBP/PMKSY (Soil & Water Conservation)
- The Deputy Commissioner and the BDOs need to ensure a balance between adhering to the Guidelines and assurance of quality and to ensure that the works are carefully monitored by the Technical Assistant of the Block (MGNREGA)
- Enquiry to be conducted by BDOs on those beneficiaries who only partially use the money for construction of PMAY-G houses and misutilize the rest of the amount. The beneficiaries should be made aware of the consequence of misutilization of funds
- More awareness programmes should be organised so that the target groups are aware of the benefits of the schemes [National Family Benefit Scheme (NFBS)]
- Improvement of NSAP MIS
- Enhancement of honorarium of cook cum helpers under MDM.
- Enhancement of conversion cost under MDM is required.
- The rate of transportation under MDM should be increased.
- Measuring scale on receipt of foodgrains is required in each school
- Extra manpower needed in order to speed up implementation of MDM scheme in both Sub-Divisions
- The District Level Monitoring Committee should monitor the Mid-Day Meal and ensure that food is cooked and served to children
- The District School Education Officer (DSEO) should conduct an enquiry on those Schools where food is not cooked and served to the children
- The DSEO needs to conduct survey on the impact of the Mid-Day Meal scheme
- The DSEO should compile a database of children gender wise.
- Need of Office Godown for Social Welfare
- If possible, Lady Supervisor post to be sanctioned as per norms of monitoring and supervision of the ICDS Scheme i.e. 15-20 nos. of Anganwadi Centres (AWCs) per Lady Supervisor
- Relaxation of population norms is required in respect of ICDS, since all the villages do not have AWC due to the norms laid down by the Ministry, i.e. a village having 150 plus population can have an AWC.
- In some villages there is lack of maintenance of toilets by the beneficiaries. Hence, Information, Education and Communication (IEC)/Awareness activity should be continued to sustain the Open Defecation Free (ODF) status
- ADOs posts (4 nos) are lying vacant in the District Agriculture Office. Immediate filling of the same is required for smooth implementation of schemes
- More fund is required for State Plan Schemes (Water Resources) under PMKSY.

SOUTH WEST GARO HILLS

- If funds received on time, MGNREGA and PMAY could be converged
- Regular payment for NSAP beneficiaries
- Counselling for the parents to send children to school
- Internet connectivity in the office of the Block Mission Co-ordinators (BMCs) and Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalaya (KGBV)
- The honorarium of cook-cum-helpers needs to be increased
- Funds for serving plates needed
- Training for SBM staff and functionaries at the district, block and village level should be imparted for effective implementation of the scheme
- Community participation (right from the time of IEC activities) is of paramount importance in order to ensure smooth implementation of the programme and to encourage proper maintenance of the scheme implemented since the actual execution of the work & maintenance thereafter will have to be carried out by communities themselves.
- Man power requirement (Technical Personnel)
- Creation of new Sub- Division with adequate field staff (JEs, SAs), adequate regular maintenance funds for Projects, etc.
- Due to hilly nature of terrain, transportation of materials to the construction site is difficult. Hence, the existing admissible cost of Rs. 2.5 lakhs /ha needs to be revised
- Villagers should have strict law against open grazing of cattle in the villages
- Funds for maintenance in AIBP are required
- Under MDM, foodgrains and cooking cost should be released simultaneously.
- Inclusion of NHM employees under the revised pay structure (Equal Pay Equal Work) is suggested.
- Under MDM, old kitchen sheds cum store rooms need to be replaced to enable proper storage of Foodgrains.
- Proper and clear information/ communication is necessary for effective implementation of SBM. Prior information is must for every activity.
- It is suggested that the non functional Dispensaries under A.H. & Vety (Kumligaon Vety. Dispensary and Anangpara Vety. Dispensary) be made functional at the earliest.

RI BHOI

- Fresh survey needs to be conducted to include more households eligible under PMAY.
- More Anganwadi Centres are required to be set up in the District.
- The Deputy Commissioner is instructed to convene a meeting with the concerned Departments and all the decisions and issues should be brought to the notice of the Chief Secretary.
- Approval & sanctioning of the proposed projects by the State and the Central Government be accorded at the earliest.
- Water Users Associations (WUA) should participate in maintaining the Projects.
- Funds are required for maintenance of canal irrigation projects under PMKSY and for projects under RKVY.
- Under RKVY Horticulture, maximum help to the farmers is required for expansion of the growing area. Farmers should be encouraged to increase production.
- Food processing unit needs to be set up in the district.

WEST GARO HILLS

- Improvement in network connectivity required
- More bank branches are needed in the interior areas
- Action should be taken against those beneficiaries, who have misutilised the financial assistance provided to them.
- More awareness programmes are required to inform people about the benefits under the scheme
- Timely flow of funds
- Immediate appointment of teachers in single teacher schools is required.
- Counselling/Psychology session or workshop for teachers for out of school children
- Funds required for immediate repair of School infrastructure.
- BIET (Block Institute of Education & Training) needs to be set up
- Construction of school buildings should be monitored regularly so as to ensure that the buildings are strong to withstand storms and cyclones and the rooms are free from water leakage in rainy season
- Enhancement of Transportation cost and early release of funds for lifting of foodgrains under MDM.
- Height and weight devices should be provided to the schools so as to ascertain that school children availing MDM meet the required height/weight ratio.
- More nutritional food items should be added to the menu under MDM. Food served to the children should contain more proteins.
- Classrooms should be made child-friendly.+
- School Managing Committees should make contribution to raise the honorarium of the cook cum helpers in the schools.
- Enhancement of Honorarium for cook-cum-helpers is required.
- Quality of foodgrains should be checked regularly. Rotten rations should be disposed promptly
- Necessary steps should be taken up for upgradation of Chandigre U P School to Secondary school.
- Department should ensure that no school teachers are appointed as Secretary / Chairman of any Village Employment Council (VEC)/Area Employment Council (AEC)
- Construction of AWCs can be done in convergence with MGNREGS
- Anganwadi Centres (AWCs) should notify the time schedule for opening and closing and should open according to the schedule.
- AWC should be centrally located for easy accessibility by the children.
- Kitchen sheds should be attached to school buildings so that repair & maintenance can be taken up
- Solar light may be provided in Health Sub-Centres due to erratic power supply in villages.
- Suitable incentives may be given to Accredited Social Health Activists (ASHA) workers considering their workload in the villages.
- Smart phones with connection may be provided to ASHA workers to enable them to take pictures and send report to the concerned authorities.

SOUTH GARO HILLS

- More bank branches are needed in each block
- Improvement in network connectivity required
- Provision for coordinated supply of building materials by the Implementing Agency to reduce the cost of building materials
- Bank branches needed in each block
- More awareness programmes are required to inform people about the benefits under the scheme
- Food grain and cooking gas should be released simultaneously
- The honorarium of Cook-cum- Helper needs to be increased
- Funds for serving plates needed.
- Kitchen shed should be attached to the school building.
- Quality of foodgrains should be checked regularly.
- New Office building for DM&HO and Addl. DM&HO and for other departments need to be constructed urgently as most of the Deptt. like Malaria, Revised National Tuberculosis Control Programme (RNTCP) etc, are functioning in Civil Hospital building
- Funds for regular maintenance of the projects is required
- Full pledged Health Engineering Wing (HEW) for NHM needs to be set up in South Garo Hills.
- The State Government should have a drinking water policy wherein broad base outline should be spelled out to tackle the problems of drinking water issues in all the habitations.
- Concerted effort should be made to protect and preserve the catchment areas including the construction of various types of recharging structures.
- The village specific requirement of water supply should be encouraged like rain water harvesting, solar pump water supply scheme etc, according to the feasibility of the area
- In respect of RKVY (Agriculture Department) fund for the construction of new check dams, irrigation canals, land development etc. may be sanctioned, since the demand for the above mentioned projects are in high demand by the farmers of the district.
- Under AIBP/PMKSY (Water Resources), to fulfill the target set by the Division, as per the District Irrigation Plan (DIP), more technical and field staff need to be sanctioned and filled up.

EAST KHASI HILLS

- Deputy Chief Minister said that School Teachers should not be VEC members & direction has been given to BDOs on this matter
- Need for conducting awareness programme from time to time by Block officials required for NSAP.
- More teachers should be appointed
- There should be convergence between A.H.& Vety. Deptt., Soil & Water Conservation Deptt. and Agriculture Deptt.
- Increase in the salary of Cook cum Helpers
- Increase in the rate of conversion cost to commensurate with the market rate.
- Proposal for new kitchen sheds should be sent to Government.
- Monitoring at Block level is required
- Increase technical manpower of the executing agency in respect of PMGSY.
- Land compensation should be given by the State Government in order to acquire land for PMGSY
- Timely release of funds
- Appointment of doctors under Rule 3F to offset the shortage of doctors serving in the CHCs/PHCs.
- Allotment of more funds to the State to clear the pending liability of ongoing NRDWP Schemes so that new works can be taken up in achieving the national goal of providing potable water supply to all the villages @ 70 lpcd by 2020.
- In respect of PMAY-G, the target fixed should be proportional to the Blocks.
- Target of beneficiaries in East Khasi Hills should be raised annually since it has 11 blocks.
- The list of beneficiaries should be vetted by the village durbars.
- In respect of PMKSY HKKP all the structures should be geo tagged and marked on map so that social auditing of the projects can be conducted.
- Priority should be given to projects to minimize the gap in potential created and utilized
- In respect of RKVY Horticulture, the farmers contribution for polyhouses may be reduced

WEST JAINTIA HILLS

- Provision of good internet accessibility at every rural village for Geo-Tagging, etc & at the Block offices
- Inclusion of more houseless/kutcha households which do not appear in the SECC 2011 list as there are genuine BPL families, outside the fold of the scheme
- Fund flow should be smooth
- Timely despatch of approved PAB (Project Approval Board)
- Enhancement of honorarium to cook cum helpers from Rs 1000/- to Rs 3000/- p.m.
- Enhancement of honorarium to the District MIS Co-ordinator & DEO cum Office Assistant as these staff are trained & equipped with the know-how of the Scheme
- Increasing the rate of cooking cost for both LPs and UPs
- Manpower is required to run the scheme smoothly
- Awareness programmes are required to make the farmers aware of the benefits of winter crops, since it is being practised on small patches only
- Vehicles are required for facilitating better & frequent supervision of the Projects as most of them are located in remote areas
- Funds for periodical maintenance of Head work & Canals are required for longevity of the structures under AIBP.
- Funds for periodical awareness campaigns on the role and responsibilities of the Water Users and water use efficiency are required.
- Under AIBP/PMKSY, it is required that the cost norms are revised from time to time in line with the schedule of rates & prevailing market rates including labour cost
- In respect of ICDS, proposal may be sent to Govt. with adequate justification for provision of vehicles to CDPOs for effective monitoring and implementation of the scheme.
- Under NRDWP, land is required to be made freely available & without payment of compensation
- As per PMGSY norm, only habitations having a population of 250 & above qualify for connectivity under the scheme. However, it was found out that habitations with less than 250 are not covered. The Department would like to suggest the inclusion of those habitations under the core network of PMGSY as these are not available in the 2001 census
- The District Swachh Bharat Mission suggested that the missing villages & households which have not been covered under the programme, should be taken up from the 15th Finance Commission Funds so that the actual ODF in the State can be realized.

Note –

EAST GARO HILLS - No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in South Garo Hills on the same date

NORTH GARO HILLS - No inputs received since Liaison Officer (LO) was engaged in Review Meeting in West Garo Hills on the same date

1st Systematic Review not yet carried out in **East Jaintia Hills District** and **South West Khasi Hills District.**

Conclusion:

The first round of Systematic Review, has been instrumental in bringing to light, the reasons for slow and sluggish implementation of the Schemes. The district heads of various departments are advised to take corrective/remedial measures in the execution of the Schemes, to render quality service to the citizens, especially to the weaker and marginalized groups of the society. Review meetings have placed special emphasis on **three Cs**: Convergence, Collaboration and Coordination, vital for pro-people, citizen centric administration, where the role of Deputy Commissioner is crucial to promote service-oriented delivery to the citizens in the respective districts. Systematic Review is indeed, a step forward in the right direction in achieving the goal of good governance.
